# A New Kind of Forgetting:
# The Brazilian Mailzine, 1998-2002

Pedro Mandagará
CAPES and CNPq/Brazil Fellow
PhD candidate in Litery Theory at PUCRS/Brazil
Visiting researcher at Stanford University

- Media durability: from stone, clay and parchment
- to paper, newsprint, thermal paper
- to digital media

Adam Farquhar, in charge of digital projects for the British Library, points out in a story in October 21st's The Economist, that "the world has in some ways a better record of the beginning of the 20th century than of the beginning of the 21st."

http://www.economist.com/node/17306104

"Another issue is ensuring that the data is stored in a format that makes it available in centuries to come. Ancient manuscripts are still readable. But much digital media from the past is readable only on a handful of fragile and antique machines, if at all. The IIPC has set a single format, making it more likely that future historians will be able to find a machine to read the data. But a single solution cannot capture all content. Web publishers increasingly serve up content-rich pages based on complex data sets. Audio and video programmes based on proprietary formats such as Windows Media Player are another challenge. What happens if Microsoft is bankrupt and forgotten in 2210?"

(http://www.economist.com/node/17306104)

- In a certain way, technology determines the aesthetics of a new media.
- ex: "Mimeograph generation" in 1970's Brazil

- In the late 1990's, Internet connection in Brazil was really slow.
- Also, most e-mail clients only read text mails, without HTML coding.
- This led to a kind of ASCII (pure text) aesthetics in the first mailzines.

- The invention of the Brazilian mailzine: Cardosonline

# COL

## CARDOS ONLINE

### fanzine por e-mail

- Appearance: ASCII aesthetics/pure text
- Periodicity: twice per week
- Content: 8 regular contributors and several ocasional ones
- Lenght: a sample issue (258) had 10,425 words
- Duration: 1998 to 2001, with 262 issues
- Readers: over 4,000 subscriptors
- Archived in qualquer.org/col

SUMÁRIO

[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[[]]]]]]]]]]]]]]]]]]]]]]]]]]]

EDITORIAL
[intro - o COL de hoje vai atrasado. Desculpem pelo transtorno.]

Os tempos são frutos secos e cinzentos. O gosto é amargo. Me fecho em mim e fico quieto. Quando morei em Praga eu era uma peste que só falava de Budapeste e da Hungria, depois fui pra Oceânia e virei patrão da coleta seletiva, seis longos anos e uma fraude na companhia telefônica. Desvio de dólares. Voltei pra Bolívia pra cuidar dos negócios da família, me mudei faz pouco pra esse barraco numa cidade do céu azul. Bom solo, bom povo, belas paisagens. Posso viver aqui.

Falta tempo, muito pouco tempo pra nada de novo, nada de muito novo que ainda não tenhamos visto, que ainda não se saiba um nome, do qual nada pode ser dito apenas por uma falta que temos de tempo e detemos de tempos em tempos algumas coisas no tecido adiposo do corpo, metabolites e outras verdades incontestáveis. Sim, rolando com a profecia, rolando escada rolante, de preferência de tarde, absolutely amazing na prática aventura nem sempre tem bons resultados pois sempre rola a possibilidade ainda que absurda de tu ser comido por um leão durante um safári no Seringhetti. Melhor morrer de mulher que de Maicóvski.

Faço tuas as minhas palavras quando tu me deixa por minha língua na tua boca mas como

- Following up on the example of Cardosonline, other mailzines emerged. Example: Kzine

```
              :::::::::::::::::::
        ::  @9@@  ::::  @@#@@  ::
     :: @@@@ :: @@@@@@ ::
     :: @@@@ : #@@@@9 ::::
     :: @@@@ @@@@@2 :::::
      :: @@@@@@@@@s :::::::
     :: @@@@@@@@@@ :::::::
       :: @@@@ : @@@@ :::::::
      :: @@@@ :: @@@@ :::::
       :: @@@@ :: @@@@ :::::
       :: @@@@ ::: @@@@# ::
       :: @@@@ :::: @@@@@ ::
             :::::::::::::::::::
```

# textos via e-mail

## contos & crônicas

<u>clique aqui</u>  para assinar
<u>clique aqui</u> para participar da
lista de discussão

**<u>Edição da semana</u>**

- Appearance: color HTML mail
- Periodicity: irregular (should be every two weeks)
- Content: 9 regular contributors and some irregular ones
- Lenght: issue 39 had 2,039 words
- Duration: 2001 to 2003 – 46 (?) editions
- Readers: around 1,000 subscriptors
- Archived: some of it in the Internet Archive, some (perhaps) retrievable in my old HD

Internet, 26 de maio de 2001

ok, a coisa começou. colaborem!

## *Editorial*

A edição passada foi um sucesso; agradeço àqueles que mandaram elogios, palavras de apoio, essas coisas. Estamos aqui e vamos continuar. Acho que a nossa data aconteceu naturalmente, é o domingo.

Em tempo de racionamento, as coisas não parecem as mesmas de 1992, quando o real valia um dólar e a inflação era zero.

:::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::

:: noss ::: zcode# :: INDEX ::::::::::

:: o.tr ::: relay* :: 1-NOITE E DIA :::::

:: ansm : 909152 :::: Marcelo BENVENUTTI ::

:: issor$AUTH| :::::::::::::::::

:: emite$proje :::::: 2-Petrolina, PE 2002

:: radia$todec ::::::: Wladimir CAZÉ ::::::

:: ções : onclu :::::::::::::::::::

:: muta :: sãode :::: 3-Ela de novo ::::::

:: ntes :: curso ::: Daniela SIGAUD :::::

:: PERI ::: n.344 :::::::::::::::

:: GOSO :::: 0ufba ::::::: [ #37 ] :::::::

:::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::::

# edição **reacionária**

Confira a tradução de Cherry para o infame editorial de um jornal americano, que acusa o Brasil de formar alianças com países inimigos dos EUA. São pessoas como o Sr. Menges que participam das "comissões", "conselhos" e organizações secretas que decidem as políticas norte americanas.

*The Washington Times - 7 de Agosto de 2002*

← → C | ⊕ web.archive.org/web/*/http://kzine.cjb.net | ☆ 🔧

**INTERNET ARCHIVE**

# WayBackMachine

| Enter Web Address: | http:// | All ▼ | Take Me Back | Adv. Search  Compare Archive Pages |

Searched for **http://kzine.cjb.net**                                    47 Results

\* denotes when site was updated.
Material typically becomes available here 6 months or more after collection, with some exceptions See FAQ.

## Archived Results from Jan 01, 1996 - latest

| 1996 | 1997 | 1998 | 1999 | 2000 | 2001 | 2002 | 2003 | 2004 | 2005 | 2006 | 20 |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 0 pages | 0 pages | 0 pages | 0 pages | 0 pages | 0 pages | 4 pages | 9 pages | 9 pages | 9 pages | 11 pages | 2 p |
| | | | | | | Jan 25, 2002 * | Jan 23, 2003 * | Jan 24, 2004 * | Jan 24, 2005 * | Feb 06, 2006 | Apr 25 |
| | | | | | | Aug 03, 2002 | May 02, 2003 * | Feb 07, 2004 * | Mar 07, 2005 | Apr 25, 2006 | Oct 22 |
| | | | | | | Sep 29, 2002 * | May 17, 2003 * | Mar 23, 2004 * | May 13, 2005 | Jun 22, 2006 * | |
| | | | | | | Nov 29, 2002 * | Aug 30, 2003 * | Apr 03, 2004 * | Aug 04, 2005 * | Jul 09, 2006 * | |
| | | | | | | | Sep 27, 2003 * | May 19, 2004 * | Aug 19, 2005 * | Sep 02, 2006 | |
| | | | | | | | Oct 17, 2003 * | Jul 27, 2004 * | Aug 20, 2005 * | Oct 17, 2006 | |
| | | | | | | | Oct 26, 2003 * | Sep 28, 2004 * | Nov 14, 2005 * | Oct 28, 2006 | |
| | | | | | | | Dec 12, 2003 * | Nov 20, 2004 * | Dec 12, 2005 * | Nov 03, 2006 | |
| | | | | | | | Dec 15, 2003 * | Dec 03, 2004 | Dec 31, 2005 * | Nov 10, 2006 | |
| | | | | | | | | | | Nov 28, 2006 | |
| | | | | | | | | | | Dec 08, 2006 | |

- Those are two examples, but there were dozens of mailzines circulating in Brazil from 1998 to 2002.
- From 2003 onwards, blogs took this space in Brazil.

- Characteristics of mailzines:
- Literary production, esp. Egotrips
- Most of authors were undergraduates, esp. Journalism

Readers (survey conducted by Marcelo Benvenutti in 2001 with 257 mailzine readers):
- 76.7% 16 to 25
- 19.5% 26 to 39
- no reader over 60
- 59.5% male
- 40.5% female

Readers (cont.)
- 48.6% felt stimulated to read more
- 54.1% felt stimulated to write more
- 19.1% felt stimulated to make their own mailzine

- Archives:
- Available online: Cardosonline
- Available through the Internet Archive: Kzine
- Print (private collection): Ogden zine (Patrick Brock)
- Old files, maybe irretrievable (TheBat! 1.0)

- Lost mailzine:
- TV Eye (Marcelo Benvenutti): lost in a computer crash.

- Last mailzine: A Hortaliça (Vanessa Bárbara),
still runing

# !! A Hortaliça !!

====================================

## Temos calopsita mansa

#077 - São Paulo, 8 de maio de 2009
Nesta edição, a incrível morsa turca que dança
www.hortifruti.org

"Ai! Por que estas coisas, e não outras?"
(Beaumarchais)

## :: VAGAS PARA TEXUGO ::

crônica inédita para o *Estadão*, censurada por determinação da Fundação
Zoológico de São Paulo S/A.

Nunca consegui levar o rato ao queijo. Não passava da primeira fase do
Enduro e arrumava doença no dia de colar lentilhas no casco da tartaruga.

References:

Benvenutti, Marcelo. Unpublished monograph on webzines, 2002.
"Born Digital". *The Economist*, Oct. 21$^{St,}$ 2010. Available at
http://www.economist.com/node/17306104
Cardosonline archive: http://qualquer.org/col/
"Cardosonline faz 100 anos". *Portal Literal Terra*, Sept. 24$^{th}$, 2008.
http://portalliteral.terra.com.br/artigos/cardosonline-faz-100-anos
Kzine archive: http://web.archive.org/web/*/http://kzine.cjb.net
"Thermal Paper Grades: Overview".
http://ukanskills.org/thermal-paper-grades-overview.htm

# A new kind of forgetting: the Brazilian mailzine, 1998-2002

Pedro Mandagará (CNPq/PUCRS)

ABSTRACT

In 1998, Brazilian journalism undergraduate André Czarnobay, a.k.a. Cardoso, invented the *mailzine*, that is, a literary magazine sent by e-mail. His mailzine *Cardosonline* quickly gathered fans and reached over four thousand subscribers in its existence. Following Cardoso, many young Brazilian writers, most of them undergraduate students, founded their own mailzines. From 2000 to 2002, several mailzines were active in the Brazilian literary scene, with the autors subscribing to and collaborating in the others mailzines. Soon afterwards, mailzines disappeared, replaced by literary websites.

The purpose of this paper is to describe the dynamics of forgetting in Internet literary production. A current myth concerning the Internet is that it is the space of memory, were everything will always be available in digital form. As we know by now, it is not so: a great deal of information produced in the Internet is forever lost, for various reasons. Some of these are market reasons, for example when an Internet host or provider is sold or is no longer free. Others are result of server failures, as happened to Paralelos.org, for years the biggest literary website in Brazil, that had all of its archive lost due to server failure. In comparison, mailzines were naturally fragile. Since they did not have a permanent hosting, being sent via e-mail periodically, they were even more prone to disappear than regular websites.

In this context, we have a complicated dynamics of forgetting. We have mailzines, such as *Cardosonline*, that were carefully archived in websites and are even now accessible to reading and research. We also have mailzines, such as *Kzine*, a mailzine I collaborated with, that are not accessible to the public but that are nonetheless safely guarded in private backups. Finally, we have mailzines that are forever lost: that is the case of most editions of Marcelo Benvenutti's several mailzines, lost (to the author) in a disk crash, and lost (to the readers, such as myself) in several mailclient upgrades that made it impossible to read older e-mails.

To describe the mailzine culture and its dynamics of forgetting, we rely on (1) the remaining mailzine archives, of which *Cardosonline*'s is the most complete and important, (2) interviews with people involved in the mailzine scene, especifically André Czernobay (*Cardosonline*), Patrick Brock (*Kzine*) and Marcelo Benvenutti (several mailzines), and (3) my personal experience, since I was part of that scene and I also lost (forgot?) part of my archive during these years since the end of the mailzine.

KEYWORDS: Brazilian literature; Digital archives; Exclusion and forgetting